

Workshop

Cross Readings

Andalusian grammarians reading Oriental grammarians,
Oriental grammarians reading Andalusian grammarians

Organizer: Francesco Binaghi

Friday 1 September 2017, 10am–3pm



**International Conference on the History of the Language Sciences
(ICHoLS XIV)**

Paris, 28 August–1 Septembre 2017

Place of the conference

Université Sorbonne Nouvelle - Paris 3
13 rue de Santeuil
75005 Paris

Cross Readings: Andalusian grammarians reading Oriental grammarians, Oriental grammarians reading Andalusian grammarians

Organizer: Francesco Binaghi
Université Sorbonne Nouvelle - Paris 3
Laboratoire d'Histoire des Théories Linguistiques (HTL)

In the study of the Arabic linguistic tradition, little attention has been paid to the role and contribution of local subtraditions – especially those of peripheral regions – for the evolution of Arabic grammatical studies throughout the centuries. Undoubtedly, one of the most important of these local subtraditions is the one which flourished in al-Andalus between the 2nd/8th and the 9th/15th centuries.

Grammatical studies in al-Andalus were introduced very early on from the Islamic East and for centuries they centred on Oriental treatises such as the *Kitāb* of Sībawayhi (d. 180/796?), the *Ġumal* of al-Zaġġāġī (d. 337/949), and the *ʿĪdāh* of al-Fārisī (d. 377/987). The high number of grammarians active in this region and the many commentaries they wrote on Oriental treatises are recorded in medieval biographical dictionaries. Their work was known to their Oriental colleagues, and later grammarians such as Ibn Hišām al-ʿAnṣārī (d. 761/1360) and al-Suyūṭī (d. 911/1505) cited them extensively. Nonetheless, the importance of these exchanges has not always been taken into due account as far as the transmission and development of the Arabic grammatical tradition are concerned.

The present workshop proposes to examine this question by focusing more precisely on the following aspects:

- 1) The extent of the exchanges in the field of grammatical studies across the Mediterranean, from East to West, from the centre of the Muslim world to its Western periphery and viceversa;
- 2) The reception of Oriental grammarians' treatises and theories in al-Andalus;

- 3) The role of Andalusian grammarians as transmitters of grammatical knowledge;
- 4) The acknowledgement and interpretation of Andalusian grammarians' work by Oriental grammarians;
- 5) The contribution of Andalusian grammarians to the evolution of Arabic grammatical and linguistic thought;
- 6) The importance of local cultural identity – as strong and as peculiar as the Andalusian identity was – in shaping grammatical thought within a wider tradition.

Indicative bibliography

- Binaghi, Francesco. 2015. 'La postérité andalouse du Ğumal d'al-Zaġġāġi.' PhD dissertation. Aix-en-Provence: Aix-Marseille Université [unpublished].
- Carter, Michael G. 2011. 'The Andalusian Grammarians, Are They Different?' In *In the Shadow of Arabic: The Centrality of Language to Arabic Culture. Studies Presented to Ramzi Baalbaki on the Occasion of His Sixtieth Birthday*, edited by Bilal Orfali. *Studies in Semitic Languages and Linguistics*, 63. Leiden/Boston: Brill, 31–48.
- Haytī, ‘Abd al-Qādir Raḥīm al-. 1993 [1975]. *Ḥaṣā’iṣ madhab al-’Andalus al-naḥwī ḥilāl al- qarn al-sābi‘ al-ḥiġrī*. Benghazi: Manšūrāt ġāmi‘at Qāryūnis, 2nd edition [1st edition Bagdad: Dār al-qādisiyya, 1395/1975].
- Humbert, Geneviève. 1995. *Les voies de la transmission du Kitāb de Sībawayhi*. *Studies in Semitic Languages and Linguistics*, 20. Leiden/New York/Köln: E.J. Brill.
- Mutlak, Albert H. 1967. *al-Ḥaraka al-luġawiyya fī al-’Andalus: mundu al-fatḥ al-‘arabī ḥattā nihāyat ‘aṣr mulūk al-ṭawā’if*. Sidon/Beirut: al-Maktaba al-‘aṣriyya.
- Peña Martín, Salvador. 2007. *Corán, palabra y verdad: Ibn al-Sīd y el humanismo en al-Andalus*. *Estudios árabes e islámicos. Monografías*, 13. Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas.
- Tubaytī, ‘Ayyād ‘Īd al-. 1417/1996. 'al-Dars al-naḥwī fī al-’Andalus fī al-qarn al-ḥāmis al-ḥiġrī'. In *al-Siġill al-‘ilmī li-nadwat al-’Andalus: qurūn min al- taqallubāt wa-l-‘aṭā’āt. Al-Qism al-rābi‘: al-luġa wa-l-’adab*, edited by ‘Abd Allāh b. ‘Alī al-Zaydān et alii. Riyad: Maṭbū‘āt maktabat al-malik ‘Abd al-‘Azīz al-‘amma, 629-642.

Yaḥyāwī, Ḥafīza. 2011. *'Ishāmāt nuḥāt al-Maġrib wa-l-'Andalus fī ta'ṣīl al-dars al-naḥwī al-‘arabī ḥilāl al-qarnayni al-sādis wa-l-sābi‘ al-ḥiġriyyayni*. Tizi Ouzou: Manšūrāt maḥbar al-mumārasāt al-luġawiyya fī al-Ġazā’ir.

Yāsīn, ‘Ayman Hišām. 2015. *al-Dars al-naḥwī fī al-'Andalus: min al-qarn al-sādis ḥattā nihāyat al-qarn al-tāmin al-ḥiġriyyayn*. Tamkīn al-luġa al-‘arabiyya, 8. Damascus: al-Hay’a al-‘amma al-sūriyya li-l-kitāb.

Programme

Early reflections on language

Raoul Villano (Roma Tre University)

'Eastern and Western receptions of Sībawayhi: al-Sīrafī and al-Šantamarī on a difficult passage of the *Kitāb*'

Georgine Ayoub (INALCO/CERMOM)

'Ibn Sīda reading Ibn Ğinnī: The nature of language'

Which conception of grammar?

Jean-Patrick Guillaume (Université Sorbonne Nouvelle - Paris 3/HTL)

'Un critique andalou du *Kitāb al-'Īdāḥ* d'al-Fārisī: la *Risālat al-'Ifṣāḥ* d'Ibn al-Ṭarāwa'

Marta Campanelli (University for Foreigners of Siena)

'The originality of Ibn Maḍā's linguistic ideas: prescriptive rules versus methodology inside *al-Radd 'alā al-nuḥāt*'

Weighing the Andalusī contribution

Giuliano Lancioni (Roma Tre University)

'Abū Ḥayyān al-Ġarnāṭī and his role in the exegetical history of Ibn Mālīk's *'Alfiyya*'

Francesco Binaghi (Université Sorbonne Nouvelle - Paris 3/HTL)

'Transferring ideas from West to East: Andalusian grammarians in late Eastern grammatical texts (8th/14th century onwards)'

Abstracts

Eastern and Western Receptions of Sībawayhi: al-Sīrafī and al-Šantamarī on a Difficult Passage of the *Kitāb*

Raoul Villano (Roma Tre University)

The chapter on the accidents that may occur to the form of words (*bāb mā yakūnu fī al-lafẓ min al-aʿrād*, vol. 1, pp. 24-25) in Sībawayhi's (d. 180/796?) *Kitāb* aroused, for centuries to come, a large debate, both about the real meaning of Sībawayhi's somehow cryptical words as about their theoretical and grammatical correctness. Particularly his interpretation of the Arabic form *astāʿa/yuṣṭīʿu* (other times read as *iṣṭāʿa/yasṭīʿu*) as a case of substitution (*ʿiwaḍ*), or better as an addition (*ziyāda*) of the letter *sīn* as a substitution for the disappearance of the vowel supposed to be originally over the weak letter *wāw* (in the fourth form of the verb *aṭāʿa/yuṭīʿu*) and not as a case of deletion (*ḥaḍf*) of the letter *tāʾ* from the tenth derivative form of the verb *is-taṭāʿa/yastaṭīʿu* will undergo the critics of many grammarians.

An echo of this early debate emerges later in the commentaries on the *Kitāb* of Sībawayhi, such as that of al-Sīrafī (d. Baghdad in 368/979) and that of al-Šantamarī (d. Seville in 476/1083). Mainly in this latter we can see a Western reception of this originally Eastern debate. In this process of revision the completeness in the exposition of the many different opinions is followed, in spite of the original divergence, by a certain uniformity, of which we will try to understand the authorship and the origin, both in the judgements as in the linguistic thinking.

Bibliography

Sources

Šantamarī (al-), ʿAbū al-Ḥaġġāġ Yūsuf b. Sulaymān al-ʿAʿlam. *al-Nukat fī tafsīr Kitāb Sībawayhi*. Ed. Rašīd Balḥabīb. Rabat, Wizārat al-ʿawqāf wa-l-šuʿūn al-ʿislāmiyya, 1999 (3 vols).

Sībawayhi, 'Abū Bišr 'Amr b. 'Utmān. *al-Kitāb*. Ed. 'Abd al-Salām Muḥammad Ḥārūn. Cairo, Dār al-qalam, 1966-1977 (5 vols).

Sīrāfi (al-), 'Abū Sa'īd al-Ḥasan b. 'Abd Allāh. *Šarḥ Kitāb Sībawayhi*. Ed. Ramaḍān 'Abd al-Tawwāb, Maḥmūd Fahmī Ḥiġāzī, and Muḥammad Hāšim 'Abd al-Dāyim. Cairo, al-Hay'a al-mišriyya al-'amma li-l-kitāb, 1986-1990 (2 vols).

Ibn Sīda reading Ibn Ğinnī: The nature of language

Georgine Ayoub (Institut National des Langues et Civilisations Orientales/
Centre de Recherches Moyen-Orient Méditerranée)

In his important dictionary *al-Muḥaṣṣaṣ*, Ibn Sīda, the most distinguished Andalusian lexicographer, born in Murcia and died in Denia in 458/1066, presents, as the foundations of his work, a conception of the nature of language and origin of speech. The latter theory is borrowed, almost literally, from *al-Ḥaṣā'is*, without this being stated explicitly. *Al-Ḥaṣā'is*, as we know, is the epistemological work of Ibn Ğinnī (d. 392/1002), a great Bagdadi grammarian of Greek origin of the 4th/10th century.

This means that, one century later, *al-Ḥaṣā'is* was well known in the circles of Andalusian grammarians. And, indeed, Ibn Sīda studied with oriental masters. He knows Ibn Ğinnī very well, holds him in great esteem, and cites, in his other dictionary, *al-Muḥkam*, several of his works, among them *al-Ḥaṣā'is*, as a bibliographical source. This reference to Ibn Ğinnī is made when he criticises the lexicographers who preceded him and their dictionaries as they have not mastered the grammar (*al-naḥw*, *al-'irāb*).

But what seems a servile borrowing is, in fact, a reading with significative differences about many important points, leading to a somewhat different conception of language. We will try in our presentation to examine these points and some aspects of Ibn Sīda's relation to Ibn Ğinnī's *Ḥaṣā'is*.

Un critique andalou du *Kitāb al-'Īdāh* d'al-Fārisī: la *Risālat al-'Ifṣāh* d'Ibn al-Ṭarāwa

Jean-Patrick Guillaume (Université Sorbonne Nouvelle - Paris 3/
Laboratoire d'Histoire des Théories Linguistiques)

La *Risālat al-'Ifṣāh* est le seul texte qui nous soit parvenu du grammairien andalou Ibn al-Ṭarāwa (m. 528/1133). Comme l'indique son titre complet, *Risālat al-'Ifṣāh bi-ba'ḍ mā ḡā'a min al-ḥata' fī al-'Īdāh* («Épître de la claire exposition, sur quelques-unes des erreurs qui figurent dans le 'Īdāh»), il s'agit d'une critique du *Kitāb al-'Īdāh* de 'Abū 'Alī al-Fārisī (m. 377/987), un manuel de grammaire très répandu à l'époque, surtout dans l'Orient musulman. Ibn al-Ṭarāwa entend démontrer que cet ouvrage jouit d'une réputation usurpée, qu'il est bien inférieur, en tant qu'ouvrage destiné aux débutants, au *Kitāb al-Ġumal* d'al-Zaġġāġī (m. 337/949), et qu'il s'écarte sur de nombreux points de la doctrine de Sibawayhi.

En prenant appui sur quelques passages du texte, et en les confrontant à l'ouvrage d'al-Fārisī, l'intervention proposée voudrait mettre en évidence que ces critiques reflètent deux conceptions nettement différentes de la grammaire, de deux manières de gérer l'héritage sibawayhien. La première, dominante dans l'Orient arabe et iranien, se caractérise avant tout par un souci de systématisation et de cohérence théorique; la seconde, surtout représentée chez les Andalous, vise plutôt à l'efficacité pédagogique, et se caractérise par une fidélité affirmée au texte du *Kitāb*. On s'efforcera de montrer pour conclure que l'attitude représentée par Ibn al-Ṭarāwa trouve de nombreux échos dans l'espace andalou-maghrébin, chez des grammairiens comme Ibn Maḍā' (m. 592/1196) ou al-Suhaylī (m. 581/1195), mais aussi bien chez Ibn Ḥaldūn (m. 784/1382).

Bibliographie

Sources primaires

Fārisī (al-), 'Abū 'Alī al-Ḥasan b. 'Aḥmad. *Kitāb al-'Īdāh fī al-naḥw*. Ed. Kāzīm Baḥr al-Marġān. Beyrouth, 'Alam al-kutub, 2011.

Ibn al-Ṭarāwa, 'Abū al-Ḥusayn Sulaymān b. Muḥammad. *Risālat al-'Ifṣāḥ*. Ed. Ḥātim Ṣāliḥ al-Ḍāmin. Beyrouth, 'Ālam al-kutub, 2011 (à la suite du *Kitāb al-'Īdāḥ* d'al-Fārisī).

Zaḡḡāḡī (al-), 'Abū l-Qāsim 'Abd al-Raḥmān b. 'Ishāq. *Kitāb al-Ġumal fī al-naḥw*. Ed. Mohammed Ben Cheneb. Paris, Klincksieck, 1957.

Sources secondaires

Baalbaki, Ramzi. 2008. *The Legacy of the Kitāb*. Leiden/Boston : Brill.

Binaghi, Francesco. 2015. *La postérité andalouse du Ġumal d'al-Zaḡḡāḡī*. Thèse de Doctorat. Aix-en-Provence : Aix-Marseille Université.

Viain, Marie. 2014. *La taxinomie des traités de grammaire arabe médiévaux (IV^e/X^e-VIII^e/XIV^e siècles)*. Thèse de Doctorat. Paris : Université Sorbonne Nouvelle - Paris 3.

The Originality of Ibn Maḍā'ʾs Linguistic Ideas: Prescriptive Rules Versus Methodology Inside *al-Radd ʿalā al-nuḥāt*

Marta Campanelli (University for Foreigners of Siena)

Ibn Maḍā' al-Qurṭubī (d. 592/1195) represents the first scholar who overtly condemned the tradition of linguistic studies formulated in the Eastern Mediterranean lands. His invective, expressed in his work *al-Radd ʿalā al-nuḥāt*, does not undermine the Arabic grammatical theory in its entirety but leaves the majority of its normative contents intact. As a matter of fact, Ibn Maḍā' attacks a series of elements representative of the method adopted by Arab grammarians in dealing with such contents: the concept of governance (*ʿamal*), the analogical reasoning (*qiyās*), the concealment of linguistic elements (*ʿiḍmār*), the secondary and tertiary causes (*ʿilal tawānī wa-tawālit*). However, the work of the Andalusian author does not remain a mere refutation but includes also a constructive part: after adducing all the theological and religious evidences against the validity of the above-mentioned elements, he empirically demonstrates how to build a new and simplified grammar. This is more evident in the second part of his work, where he illustrates three of the most obscure and abstract chapters of classical grammar: the conflict in governance (*tanāzuʿ*), the verbal occupation (*ištiḡāl*), the particles *fā-* and *wa-* followed by the subjunctive mood. An accurate study of these chapters reveals that the prescriptive rules (*ʿilal taʿlīmiyya*) they contain, correspond to those of classical Arabic theory as in its Basran formulation. Their real innovation consists in the revolutionary way Ibn Maḍā' deals with such facts. However, considered that a significant part of his methodological elements is clearly analogous to some ideas expressed by Eastern grammarians, especially those belonging to the Kufan tradition, to what extent is it possible to consider his linguistic ideas “innovative”?

Bibliography

Sources

Ibn Maḍā', 'Abū al-'Abbās 'Aḥmad b. 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Qurṭubī. *al-Radd 'alā al-nuḥāt*. Ed. Šawqī Ḍayf. Cairo, Dār al-ma'ārif, 1984.

Literature

'Ābādī, Ḥusayn Šams. 2008. 'Al-Ištiḡāl wa-l-tanāzu': bayna al-wāqi' al-luḡawī wa-l-qawā'id wa-ta'attur al-nuḥāt bi-'uṣūl al-fiqh'. *Maḡallat al-luḡa al-'arabiyya wa-'ādābi-hā* 2: 23-39.

'Īd, Muḥammad. 1989. 'Uṣūl al-naḥw al-'arabī fī nazrat al-nuḥāt wa-ra'y Ibn Maḍā' wa-ḍaw' 'ilm al-luḡa al-ḥadīth. Cairo, 'Ālam al-kutub.

Nakamura, Kōjirō. 1974. 'Ibn Maḍā's criticism of Arabic grammarians'. *Orient* 10: 89-113.

Sarṭāwī (al-), Ma'ād. 1988. *Ibn Maḍā' al-Qurṭubī wa-ḡuhūdu-hu al-naḥwiyya*. Amman, Dār maḡdalāwī.

Versteegh, Kees. 1997. 'Ibn Maḍā' and the Refutations of the Grammarians'. In *Landmarks in Linguistic Thought III: The Arabic Linguistic Tradition*, by Kees Versteegh. London/New York: Routledge, 140-152.

'Abū Ḥayyān al-Ġarnāṭī and his role in the exegetical history of Ibn Mālik's 'Alfiyya

Giuliano Lancioni (Roma Tre University)

The role of the Andalusian grammarian 'Abū Ḥayyān al-Ġarnāṭī (d. 745/1344) in the transmission of Ibn Mālik's (d. 672/1274) 'Alfiyya is hard to overstate, since he is the main link between the author and the two most renowned commentators, Ibn 'Aqīl (d. 769/1367) and Ibn Hišām (d. 761/1360).

However, 'Abū Ḥayyān's specific contribution to the exegetical history of the treatise has been relatively neglected, even if the extant part (the first half, roughly) of the commentary, the *Manḥağ al-sālik*, has long been published by Glazer.

Several reasons have conjured to produce this result: the shadow that the huge success of his pupils' commentaries shed on the master's work, a general underevaluation of the Andalusian contribution to grammar, the highlight other aspects of 'Abū Ḥayyān's production got—his *tafsīr* and especially his grammar and lexicon of Turkish, the *Kitāb al-'Idrāk li-lisān al-'atrāk*, a unicum in its structural analysis of a foreign language within the Arabic linguistic tradition—, the concentration on the quite outstanding biography of the grammarian rather than on his specific contribution to the history of linguistic theory, a reputation for difficulty that 'Abū Ḥayyān earned among practitioners of the Arabic grammatical tradition.

The proposed paper will present an analysis and a reassessment of selected passages of 'Abū Ḥayyān's commentary by highlighting a number of specific features of his approach to grammar, some of which doubtless linked to the Andalusian background of the author: a *Zāhirī* attention for the linguistic surface of the text, the interest for foreign languages (probably reminiscent of the vibrant, multilingual environment of his native al-Andalus), a relatively contrasting attitude towards Ibn Mālik's own opinions, the link between linguistic and Qur'anic exegesis.

The overall picture shows a much more important role of Western Arab grammarians in the exegetical history of the 'Alfiyya than usually assumed, a feature

that might shed an interesting light on the intellectual contribution of al-Andalus to the history of the Arabic linguistic thinking.

Bibliography

- Bergter, Annette. 1988. *Das Kapitel inna wa-aḥawātuhā aus dem “Manhağ as-sālik” des Grammatikers Abū Ḥayyān al-Ġarnāṭī (1256-1344)*. Arabistische Texte und Studien. Hildesheim/New York: G. Olms.
- Glazer, Sidney. 1942. 'A Noteworthy Passage from an Arab Grammatical Text'. *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 62: 106-108.
- Lancioni, Giuliano. 1996. 'Rhetoric and Ideology in Abū Ḥayyān's Kitāb al-Idrāk'. *The Arabist* 17: 105-119.

**Transferring ideas from West to East:
Andalusian grammarians in late Eastern grammatical texts
(8th/14th century onwards)**

Francesco Binaghi (Université Sorbonne Nouvelle - Paris 3/
Laboratoire d'Histoire des Théories Linguistiques)

Andalusian and, more generally, Western grammarians seem to have long been neglected by their Oriental colleagues. The case of the Egyptian Ibn al-Ḥāḡib (d. 646/1249) speaks for itself: he is the author of a commentary (*Šarḥ al-Muqaddima al-ḡuzūliyya*) on the Western al-Ḡuzūlī (d. 607/1210), a Maghrebi grammarian who also lived in al-Andalus, but Ibn al-Ḥāḡib never mentions the latter in his main grammatical treatises such as *al-Kāfiya* or *al-ʿIdāh fī šarḥ al-Mufaṣṣal*.

However, the contribution of Andalusian grammarians becomes apparent from the 8th/14th century on. ʿAbū Ḥayyān al-Ġarnāṭī (d. 745/1344), an Andalusian settled in Cairo, is a key figure as transmitter and commentator of the treatises (notably *al-ʿAlfiyya* and *al-Tashīl*) of Ibn Mālik (d. 672/1274), another grammarian of Andalusian origin who settled in Damascus. The role of Andalusian learned men in the perpetuation of the textual tradition of the *Kitāb* of Sībawayhi (d. 180/796?) has also been clearly highlighted by Humbert (*Les voies de la transmission du Kitāb de Sībawayhi*, 1995).

It is also thanks to the work and teaching of ʿAbū Ḥayyān al-Ġarnāṭī that the names, treatises and theories of many Andalusian grammarians were spread to the Islamic East; his *Irtiṣāf al-ḍarab* is a rich source in this regard. It is hardly surprising that ʿAbū Ḥayyān's pupil Ibn Hišām al-ʿAnṣārī (d. 761/1360) also mentions a great number of Andalusian scholars in his treatises *Muḡnī al-labīb* and *Šarḥ Qaṭr al-nadā*. From this moment on, Andalusian grammarians regularly find their place in Eastern scholars' writings, as this is attested, for instance, by *al-ʿAšbāh wa-l-naẓāʿir* of al-Suyūṭī (d. 911/1505), or even later by the *Ḥizānat al-ʿadab* and the *Šarḥ ʿabyāt Muḡnī al-labīb* of ʿAbd al-Qādir al-Baḡdādī (d. 1093/1682). Nonetheless, such Andalusian presence within late Eastern grammatical works has not been given due attention.

This paper intends to evaluate this aspect of the intellectual transfer from the Islamic West to the Islamic East in order to provide some understanding of the extent and importance of the Andalusian contribution to the late (i.e. post the 8th/14th century) grammatical theory.